

**OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,  
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.**

521 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Suite 1700  
New York, New York 10175  
(212) 292-4314

Allyson M. Smith (AS-4750)  
Peter O. Hughes (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Attorneys for Defendant  
Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----  
SUE EARL,

Plaintiff,

vs.

NOVARTIS CONSUMER HEALTH,  
INC.,

Defendant.  
-----

: Hon. Richard M. Berman, U.S.D.J.  
: Civil No.: 07 CIV 9595 (RMB)  
:

: **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**  
: (by electronic filing)  
:

I hereby certify that on July 30, 2008, the following documents:

**DEFENDANT'S REPLY BRIEF IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR  
SUMMARY JUDGMENT;**

**SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF ALLYSON M. SMITH ESQ., IN  
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT (with  
exhibits);**

were filed with the Clerk of the Court and served upon Sanford, Wittels & Heisler, LLP, counsel for plaintiff Sue Earl, in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and/or the Southern District's Local Rules and/or the Southern District's Rules on Electronic Service. The above listed documents are available for viewing and downloading from the ECF system.

s/Allyson M. Smith  
Peter O. Hughes (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Allyson M. Smith (AS-4750)

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,  
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.  
521 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Suite 1700  
New York, New York 10175  
(212) 292-4314  
[allyson.smith@ogletreedeakins.com](mailto:allyson.smith@ogletreedeakins.com)  
[peter.hughes@ogletreedeakins.com](mailto:peter.hughes@ogletreedeakins.com)

Attorneys for Defendant  
Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.

6537827.1 (OGLETREE)